MEETING

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

SECRETARY OF STATE

VOTING SYSTEMS PANEL

SECRETARY OF STATE

1500 11TH STREET

AUDITORIUM

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

MONDAY, NOVEMBER 3, 2003 1:00 P.M.

Reported by: Michael Mac Iver

Shorthand Reporter

APPEARANCES

PANEL MEMBERS

Mr. Mark Kyle, Chairperson

Mr. Marc Carrel

Mr. John Mott-Smith

Ms. Caren Daniels-Meade

Mr. Bernard Soriano

STAFF

Ms. Dawn Mehlhaff

INDEX

		Page
1.	PULLED: Sequoia Voting Systems - Modifications to WinEDS Software and Edge Firmware	
2.	PULLED: Diebold Election Systems - Modifications to the AccuVote-TS	
3.	PULLED: Certification Procedures	
4.	Public Comment Thomas Murdoch Jim Martin Kim Alexander	6 7 9
5.	Adjournment	10
6.	Reporter's Certificate	11

PROCEEDINGS

- 2 CHAIRPERSON KYLE: Thank you for waiting. My name
- 3 is Mark Kyle. And we have a number of people absent today.
- 4 And we have a new appointment to the VSP panel. We have
- 5 Tony Miller absent, and Chon Gutierrez absent today, and we
- 6 have Terry Carbel who's recused herself from today's
- 7 discussion because of a potential conflict that dates
- 8 backwards in time to a previous employer. She normally sits
- 9 up here. And we have one of -- is it one position or two?
- 10 We have one, Tony filled one, and we've appointed Caren
- 11 Daniels-Meade to the third position.
- 12 Panel members, if you would turn off your cell
- 13 phones and pagers, I'd appreciate it.
- 14 If you would take a look, I'm just going to go
- 15 through some procedural stuff and then ask for Marc Carrel
- 16 to take over on the substantive items for me. Procedurally
- 17 we dealt with Agenda Item Number 1 at the last meeting, so
- 18 we're not doing that today. And Agenda Item Number 3,
- 19 Certification Procedures, was to be a staff report at the
- 20 last VSP meeting, we rolled it over to this meeting, and
- 21 it's still not ready, so it will not be reported on today.
- 22 Agenda Item 3 is stricken from the agenda, and I will look
- 23 for any objections to that. And I'm going to suggest that
- 24 we do not schedule it until we know that it can be something
- 25 date certain. Any objections to that?

1 All right. And that leaves us with Agenda Item

- 2 Number 2. So, Marc Carrel, I'm going to turn it over to
- 3 you.
- 4 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: It has come to our attention
- 5 that some very disconcerting information regarding this item
- 6 and we were informed that this company, Diebold, may have
- 7 installed uncertified software in at least one county before
- 8 it was certified. Given this information, I would move that
- 9 we do not take up this item today and we indefinitely table
- 10 the item until the Secretary can complete an investigation
- 11 about this.
- 12 PANEL MEMBER MOTT-SMITH: Second.
- 13 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Second from John Mott-Smith.
- 14 All those in favor?
- 15 (Ayes.)
- 16 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Any opposition?
- 17 As such we're not taking up Item Number 2 because
- 18 of that information. And so we will now have public comment
- 19 and I would call people to speak at the podium to comment on
- 20 any items, if they still wish to comment.
- 21 Item Number 2 was Diebold, yes. We will not be
- 22 taking any questions from the audience. Only those who are
- 23 called to the podium will be recognized.
- 24 Sally McPherson, Registrar of Voters from the
- 25 County of San Diego.

- 1 Pardon me?
- Okay. Laura Winslow, Solano County ROV.
- Okay.
- 4 Deborah Hench, San Joaquin County Registrar.
- 5 Thomas Murdoch, member of the public.
- 6 MR. MURDOCH: Do I speak into the mike?
- 7 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Just speak into the mike.
- 8 You have two minutes.
- 9 MR. MURDOCH: Our right to vote is the most
- 10 precious right we have in the United States of America.
- 11 This right should now be put before American citizens, if
- 12 the manner in which we vote is to change. The documentation
- 13 I have heard about Diebold is troubling. The information
- 14 from former employees is that they had 200 security flaws in
- 15 GEMS and other software. There have been numerous errors of
- 16 whole numbers in casting votes for the correct choices a
- 17 voter has made. Both errors apply to Sequoia and Diebold
- 18 touch screens. For example, although a district has a
- 19 hundred voters, yet when the numbers are tallied, a hundred
- 20 and fifty votes are counted.
- 21 Problem testing machines is an easy one to solve.
- 22 Having a paper trail, receipts like the one at an ATM should
- 23 be given to the voter at the end of their selection. This
- 24 will show the voter that the machine correctly recorded who
- 25 and what they voted for. The machines themselves should

1 generate a paper trail. In the event of a recount due to a

- 2 computer error, an audit of the system will be useless. The
- 3 machine must generate a paper receipt for every vote casted.
- 4 This will be the only accuracy issue needed for a hand
- 5 recount.
- 6 I attended this meeting so I could represent my
- 7 fellow Americans who could not attend. As an American
- 8 citizen, I am part of this government. We the people have a
- 9 right to be involved in the decisionmaking concerning our
- 10 right to vote, making sure that the touch screen voting
- 11 machines have a paper trail is not a request, it is a
- 12 demand. Thank you.
- 13 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Thank you. If you have
- 14 anything written, you're more than welcome to submit it to
- 15 the panel.
- 16 Next, Jim Martin. And we've received a letter in
- 17 writing from Mr. Martin as well.
- 18 MR. MARTIN: Actually, the letter you just
- 19 received is not related to Diebold. It's a different
- 20 certification problem. I have, however, submitted two prior
- 21 letters to your office dated October 16th, is the later one,
- 22 and September 19th is the earlier one. And I hope those two
- 23 letters are on file with your office.
- 24 My main concern at this point with Diebold is the
- 25 lack of certification of Windows CE. I really hope that's

1 the piece of custom software that you guys are focusing on.

- 2 And if it's not, it should be. Windows CE is loaded into
- 3 firmware on both the TS and TSx terminals, and it is
- 4 completely customized to the local hardware environment.
- 5 That means Diebold wrote the maximum pieces of code to get
- 6 that thing working with the touch screens. Numerous
- 7 Microsoft internal documents detail that Windows CE is not a
- 8 product so much as it is a kit. That means that thousands
- 9 of lines of code were written by Diebold or whoever they
- 10 hired to build the terminals, it hardly matters, the
- 11 contractor, and was not submitted for certification with
- 12 anyone.
- 13 In fact, according to the internal Diebold e-mails
- 14 when three lower-level Diebold employees wanted to run
- 15 Windows CE past lab certification, they were stomped on by
- 16 the top technical person within Diebold Elections Systems
- 17 named Hal Berdol. They wrote a memo late on Friday saying,
- 18 yes, we ran Windows CE past the lab. Monday morning Hal
- 19 Berdol got that message and said, no, we don't even mention
- 20 Windows CE.
- 21 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: You have 30 seconds left.
- MR. MARTIN: All right. If you're not looking at
- 23 CE, you should be.
- 24 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Thank you very much. I see
- 25 this is also a Public Records Act request.

1 MR. MARTIN: Yes. That's something that just

- 2 popped up yesterday.
- 3 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Okay, we'll put this
- 4 forward.
- 5 MR. MARTIN: By all means.
- 6 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Thank you very much for
- 7 submitting it.
- 8 The final person who submitted a card, if anyone
- 9 else would like to make public comment, you can obtain a
- 10 card at the front table, Kim Alexander.
- 11 MS. ALEXANDER: I'm back again. Is this on? Kim
- 12 Alexander with the California Voter Foundation.
- 13 Since Item Number 2 has been tabled, some of the
- 14 comments I was going to make, I won't. But I do want to
- 15 recommend a procedure that this committee could follow in
- 16 future meetings. Myself and a number of people who are
- 17 trying to follow the voting technology issues and the
- 18 certification process have been coming to these meetings and
- 19 trying to understand the staff reports that are presented to
- 20 the Voting Systems Panel when a voting system is tested and
- 21 evaluated. And I would like to recommend that some element
- 22 of those reports be made available to the public, that there
- 23 be written staff reports posted on your website, so that in
- 24 anticipation of these meetings, citizens who want to follow
- 25 the process can read ahead of time what kinds of

Voting Systems Panel and be able to comment intelligently on

1	modifications	to	voting	systems	will	be	taken	up	by	the

- 3 those changes. And that's my only comment. Thank you.
- 4 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Thank you.
- 5 If there is no one else that has a wish or a
- 6 desire to make a public comment, I would entertain a motion
- 7 for adjournment.
- 8 PANEL MEMBER DANIELS-MEADE: So moved.
- 9 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: So moved by Member Daniels-
- 10 Meade.

2

- 11 PANEL MEMBER MOTT-SMITH: Second.
- 12 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: Second by Mr. Mott-Smith.
- 13 All in favor.
- 14 (Ayes.)
- 15 PANEL MEMBER CARREL: The motion is approved.
- 16 Thank you very much.
- 17 (Thereupon the meeting of the Voting
- 18 Systems Panel was concluded at 1:20 p.m.
- on November 3, 2003.)

20

21

22

23

24

25

Т	CERTIFICATE OF SHORTHAND REPORTER
2	I, MICHAEL J. MAC IVER, a Shorthand Reporter, do
3	hereby certify that I am a disinterested person herein; that
4	I reported the foregoing Voting Systems Panel proceedings in
5	shorthand writing; that I thereafter caused my shorthand
6	writing to be transcribed into typewriting.
7	I further certify that I am not of counsel or
8	attorney for any of the parties to said Voting Systems Panel
9	proceedings, or in any way interested in the outcome of said
10	Voting Systems Panel proceedings.
11	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
12	this 17th day of November 2003.
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	Michael J. Mac Iver
19	Shorthand Reporter
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	